

Symmetric Numerical Semigroups

Generated by Fibonacci and Lucas Triples

Leonid G. Fel

Department of Civil Engineering, Technion, Haifa 3200, Israel

e-mail: lfel@tx.technion.ac.il

March 11, 2008

Abstract

The symmetric numerical semigroups $S(F_a, F_b, F_c)$ and $S(L_k, L_m, L_n)$ generated by three Fibonacci (F_a, F_b, F_c) and Lucas (L_k, L_m, L_n) numbers are considered. Based on divisibility properties of the Fibonacci and Lucas numbers we establish necessary and sufficient conditions for both semigroups to be symmetric and calculate their Hilbert generating series, Frobenius numbers and genera.

Keywords: Symmetric numerical semigroups, Fibonacci and Lucas numbers.

2000 Mathematics Subject Classification: Primary – 20M14, Secondary – 11N37.

1 Introduction

Recently the numerical semigroups $S(F_i, F_{i+2}, F_{i+k})$, $i, k \geq 3$, generated by three Fibonacci numbers F_j were discussed in [8]. It turns out that the remarkable properties of F_j in these triples suffice to calculate the Frobenius number $\mathcal{F}(S)$ and genus $G(S)$ of semigroup. In this article we show that a nature of Fibonacci and Lucas numbers is sufficient not only to calculate the specific parameters of semigroups, but also to describe completely the structure of symmetric numerical semigroups $S(F_a, F_b, F_c)$, $3 \leq a < b < c$, and $S(L_k, L_m, L_n)$, $2 \leq k < m < n$, generated by Fibonacci¹ and Lucas numbers, respectively. Based on divisibility properties of these numbers we establish necessary and sufficient conditions for both semigroups to be symmetric and calculate their Hilbert generating series, Frobenius numbers and genera.

¹We avoid to use the term "Fibonacci semigroup" because it has been already reserved for another algebraic structure [10].

2 Basic properties of the 3D symmetric numerical semigroups

Recall basic definitions and known facts about 3D numerical semigroups mostly focusing on their symmetric type. Let $S(d_1, d_2, d_3) \subset \mathbb{Z}_+ \cup \{0\}$ be the additive numerical semigroup with zero finitely generated by a minimal set of positive integers $\{d_1, d_2, d_3\}$ such that $3 \leq d_1 < d_2 < d_3$, $\gcd(d_1, d_2, d_3) = 1$. Semigroup $S(d_1, d_2, d_3)$ is said to be generated by the minimal set of three natural numbers if there are no nonnegative integers $b_{i,j}$ for which the following dependence holds:

$$d_i = \sum_{j \neq i}^m b_{i,j} d_j, \quad b_{i,j} \in \{0, 1, \dots\} \quad \text{for any } i \leq m. \quad (1)$$

For short we denote the vector (d_1, d_2, d_3) by $\mathbf{d}^3$. Following Johnson [6] define *the minimal relation* $\mathcal{R}_3$ for given $\mathbf{d}^3$ as follows

$$\mathcal{R}_3 \begin{pmatrix} d_1 \\ d_2 \\ d_3 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \mathcal{R}_3 = \begin{pmatrix} a_{11} & -a_{12} & -a_{13} \\ -a_{21} & a_{22} & -a_{23} \\ -a_{31} & -a_{32} & a_{33} \end{pmatrix}, \quad \begin{cases} \gcd(a_{11}, a_{12}, a_{13}) = 1 \\ \gcd(a_{21}, a_{22}, a_{23}) = 1 \\ \gcd(a_{31}, a_{32}, a_{33}) = 1 \end{cases}, \quad (2)$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} a_{11} &= \min \{v_{11} \mid v_{11} \geq 2, v_{11}d_1 = v_{12}d_2 + v_{13}d_3, v_{12}, v_{13} \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\}\}, \\ a_{22} &= \min \{v_{22} \mid v_{22} \geq 2, v_{22}d_2 = v_{21}d_1 + v_{23}d_3, v_{21}, v_{23} \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\}\}, \\ a_{33} &= \min \{v_{33} \mid v_{33} \geq 2, v_{33}d_3 = v_{31}d_1 + v_{32}d_2, v_{31}, v_{32} \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\}\}. \end{aligned} \quad (3)$$

The uniquely defined values of $v_{ij}, i \neq j$ which give a_{ii} will be denoted by $a_{ij}, i \neq j$. Note that due to minimality of the set (d_1, d_2, d_3) the elements $a_{ij}, i, j \leq 3$ satisfy

$$\begin{aligned} a_{11} &= a_{21} + a_{31}, \quad a_{22} = a_{12} + a_{32}, \quad a_{33} = a_{13} + a_{23}, \\ d_1 &= a_{22}a_{33} - a_{23}a_{32}, \quad d_2 = a_{11}a_{33} - a_{13}a_{31}, \quad d_3 = a_{11}a_{22} - a_{12}a_{21}. \end{aligned} \quad (4)$$

The smallest integer $C(\mathbf{d}^3)$ such that all integers $s, s \geq C(\mathbf{d}^3)$, belong to $S(\mathbf{d}^3)$ is called *the conductor* of $S(\mathbf{d}^3)$,

$$C(\mathbf{d}^3) := \min \{s \in S(\mathbf{d}^3) \mid s + \mathbb{Z}_+ \cup \{0\} \subset S(\mathbf{d}^3)\}.$$

The number $\mathcal{F}(\mathbf{d}^3) = C(\mathbf{d}^3) - 1$ is referred to as *the Frobenius number*. Denote by $\Delta(\mathbf{d}^3)$ the complement of $S(\mathbf{d}^3)$ in $\mathbb{Z}_+ \cup \{0\}$, i.e. $\Delta(\mathbf{d}^3) = \mathbb{Z}_+ \cup \{0\} \setminus S(\mathbf{d}^3)$. The cardinality ($\#$) of the set $\Delta(\mathbf{d}^3)$ is called *the number of gaps*, $G(\mathbf{d}^3) := \#\{\Delta(\mathbf{d}^3)\}$, or *genus* of $S(\mathbf{d}^3)$.

The semigroup ring $k[X_1, X_2, X_3]$ over a field k of characteristic 0 associated with $S(\mathbf{d}^3)$ is a polynomial subring graded by $\deg X_i = d_i, i = 1, 2, 3$ and generated by all monomials z^{d_i} . The

Hilbert series $H(\mathbf{d}^3; z)$ of a graded subring $k[z^{d_1}, z^{d_2}, z^{d_3}]$ is defined [11] by

$$H(\mathbf{d}^3; z) = \sum_{s \in S(\mathbf{d}^3)} z^s = \frac{Q(\mathbf{d}^3; z)}{(1 - z^{d_1})(1 - z^{d_2})(1 - z^{d_3})}, \quad (5)$$

where $Q(\mathbf{d}^3; z)$ is a polynomial in z .

The semigroup $S(\mathbf{d}^3)$ is called *symmetric* iff for any integer s holds

$$s \in S(\mathbf{d}^3) \iff \mathcal{F}(\mathbf{d}^3) - s \notin S(\mathbf{d}^3). \quad (6)$$

Otherwise $S(\mathbf{d}^3)$ is called *non-symmetric*. The integers $G(\mathbf{d}^3)$ and $C(\mathbf{d}^3)$ are related [5] as,

$$2G(\mathbf{d}^3) = C(\mathbf{d}^3) \text{ if } S(\mathbf{d}^3) \text{ is symmetric semigroup, and } 2G(\mathbf{d}^3) > C(\mathbf{d}^3) \text{ otherwise.} \quad (7)$$

Notice that $S(\mathbf{d}^2)$ is always symmetric semigroup [1]. The number of independent entries a_{ij} in (2) can be reduced if $S(\mathbf{d}^3)$ is symmetric: at least one off-diagonal element of $\widehat{\mathcal{R}}_3$ vanishes, e.g. $a_{13} = 0$ and therefore $a_{11}d_1 = a_{12}d_2$. Due to *minimality* of the last relation we have by (2) the following equalities and consequently the matrix representation as well [4] (see also [3], Section 6.2)

$$\begin{aligned} a_{11} = a_{21} = \text{lcm}(d_1, d_2)/d_1, \quad a_{12} = a_{22} = \text{lcm}(d_1, d_2)/d_2, \\ a_{33} = d_1/a_{22} = d_2/a_{11}, \quad a_{23} = 0, \end{aligned} \quad \widehat{\mathcal{R}}_{3s} = \begin{pmatrix} a_{11} & -a_{22} & 0 \\ -a_{11} & a_{22} & 0 \\ -a_{31} & -a_{32} & a_{33} \end{pmatrix}, \quad (8)$$

where subscript "s" stands for symmetric semigroup. Combining (8) with formula for the Frobenius number of symmetric semigroup [4], $\mathcal{F}(\mathbf{d}_s^3) = a_{22}d_2 + a_{33}d_3 - \sum_{i=1}^3 d_i$, we get finally,

$$\mathcal{F}(\mathbf{d}_s^3) = e_1 + e_2 - \sum_{i=1}^3 d_i, \quad e_1 = \text{lcm}(d_1, d_2), \quad e_2 = d_3 \text{ gcd}(d_1, d_2). \quad (9)$$

If $S(\mathbf{d}^3)$ is symmetric semigroup then $k[S(\mathbf{d}^3)]$ is a complete intersection [4] and the numerator $Q(\mathbf{d}^3; z)$ in the Hilbert series (5) reads [11]

$$Q(\mathbf{d}^3; z) = (1 - z^{e_1})(1 - z^{e_2}). \quad (10)$$

2.1 Structure of generating triples of symmetric numerical semigroups

Two following statements, Theorem 1 and Corollary 1, give necessary and sufficient conditions for $S(\mathbf{d}^3)$ to be symmetric.

Theorem 1 ([4] and Proposition 3, [14]) *If a semigroup $S(d_1, d_2, d_3)$ is symmetric then its minimal generating set has the following presentation with two relatively not prime elements:*

$$\text{gcd}(d_1, d_2) = \lambda, \quad \text{gcd}(d_3, \lambda) = 1, \quad d_3 \in S\left(\frac{d_1}{\lambda}, \frac{d_2}{\lambda}\right). \quad (11)$$

It turns out that (11) gives also sufficient conditions for $S(\mathbf{d}^3)$ to be symmetric. This follows by Corollary 1 of the old Lemma of Watanabe [14] for semigroup $S(\mathbf{d}^m)$

Lemma 1 (Lemma 1, [14]) *Let $S(d_1, \dots, d_m)$ be a numerical semigroup, a and b be positive integers such that: (i) $c \in S(d_1, \dots, d_m)$ and $c \neq d_i$, (ii) $\gcd(c, \lambda) = 1$.*

Then semigroup $S(\lambda d_1, \dots, \lambda d_m, c)$ is symmetric iff $S(d_1, \dots, d_m)$ is symmetric.

Combining Lemma 1 with the fact that every semigroup $S(\mathbf{d}^2)$ is symmetric we arrive at Corollary.

Corollary 1 *Let $S(d_1, d_2)$ be a numerical semigroup, c and λ be positive integers, $\gcd(c, \lambda) = 1$. If $c \in S(d_1, d_2)$, then the semigroup $S(\lambda d_1, \lambda d_2, c)$ is symmetric.*

In Corollary 1 the requirement $c \neq d_1, d_2$ can be omitted since both semigroups $S(\lambda d_1, \lambda d_2, d_1)$ and $S(\lambda d_1, \lambda d_2, d_2)$ are generated by two elements $(d_1, \lambda d_2)$ and are also symmetric.

Finish this Section with important proposition adapted to the 3D numerical semigroups.

Theorem 2 ([5], Proposition 1.14)

The numerical semigroup $S(3, d_2, d_3)$, $\gcd(3, d_2, d_3) = 1$, $3 \nmid d_2$ and $d_3 \notin S(3, d_2)$, is never symmetric.

3 Divisibility of Fibonacci and Lucas numbers

We recall a remarkable divisibility properties of Fibonacci and Lucas numbers which are necessary for further consideration. Theorem 3 dates back to E. Lucas [7] (Section 11, p. 206),

Theorem 3 *Let F_m and F_n , $m > n$, be the Fibonacci numbers. Then*

$$\gcd(F_m, F_n) = F_{\gcd(m, n)}. \quad (12)$$

As for Theorem 4, its weak version was given by Carmichael [2]². We present here its modern form proved by Ribenboim [12] and McDaniel [9].

Theorem 4 *Let L_m and L_n be the Lucas numbers, and let $m = 2^a m'$, $n = 2^b n'$, where m' and n' are odd positive integers and $a, b \geq 0$. Then*

$$\gcd(L_m, L_n) = \begin{cases} L_{\gcd(m, n)} & \text{if } a = b, \\ 2 & \text{if } a \neq b, \ 3 \mid \gcd(m, n), \\ 1 & \text{if } a \neq b, \ 3 \nmid \gcd(m, n). \end{cases} \quad (13)$$

²Carmichael [2] (Theorem 7, p. 40) has proven only the most hard part of Theorem 4, namely, the 1st equality in (13).

We also recall another basic divisibility property of Lucas numbers,

$$L_m = 0 \pmod{2}, \quad \text{iff} \quad m = 0 \pmod{3}. \quad (14)$$

We'll need a technical Corollary which follows by consequence of Theorem 4.

Corollary 2 *Let L_m and L_n be the Lucas numbers, and let $m = 2^a m'$, $n = 2^b n'$, where m' and n' are odd positive integers and $a, b \geq 0$. Then*

$$\gcd(L_m, L_n) = 1, \quad \text{iff} \quad \begin{cases} a = b = 0, & \gcd(m', n') = 1, \\ a \neq b, & \gcd(3, \gcd(m, n)) = 1. \end{cases} \quad (15)$$

4 Symmetric numerical semigroups generated by Fibonacci triple

In this Section we consider symmetric numerical semigroups generated by three Fibonacci numbers F_c , F_b and F_a , $c > b > a \geq 3$. The two first values $a = 3, 4$ are of special interest because of Fibonacci numbers $F_3 = 2$ and $F_4 = 3$. First, the semigroup $S(F_3, F_b, F_c)$, $\gcd(2, F_b, F_c) = 1$, is always symmetric and has actually 2 generators. Next, according to Theorem 2 the semigroup $S(F_4, F_b, F_c)$ is symmetric iff at least one of two requirements, $3 \nmid F_b$ and $F_c \notin S(3, F_b)$, is broken. Avoiding those trivial cases we state

Theorem 5 *Let F_c , F_b and F_a be the Fibonacci numbers where $c > b > a \geq 5$. Then a numerical semigroup $S(F_a, F_b, F_c)$ is symmetric iff*

$$\lambda = \gcd(a, b) \geq 3, \quad \gcd(\lambda, c) = 1, 2, \quad F_c \in S\left(\frac{F_a}{F_\lambda}, \frac{F_b}{F_\lambda}\right), \quad (16)$$

Proof By Theorem 1 and Corollary 1 a numerical semigroup $S(F_a, F_b, F_c)$ is symmetric iff

$$g = \gcd(F_a, F_b) > 1, \quad \gcd(g, F_c) = 1, \quad F_c \in S\left(\frac{F_a}{g}, \frac{F_b}{g}\right). \quad (17)$$

By consequence of Theorem 3 and definition of Fibonacci numbers we get

$$\begin{cases} g = F_\lambda > 1 & \rightarrow \gcd(a, b) \geq 3, \\ \gcd(F_\lambda, F_c) = F_{\gcd(\lambda, c)} = 1 & \rightarrow \gcd(\lambda, c) = 1, 2. \end{cases} \quad (18)$$

The last containment in (17) gives

$$F_c = A \frac{F_a}{g} + B \frac{F_b}{g} = A \frac{F_a}{F_\lambda} + B \frac{F_b}{F_\lambda}, \quad A, B \in \mathbb{Z}_+,$$

that finishes the proof of Theorem. $\square$

Theorem 5 remains true for any permutation of indices in triple (F_a, F_b, F_c) . By (9), (10) and (16) we get

Corollary 3 *Let F_c , F_b and F_a be the Fibonacci numbers and numerical semigroup $\mathbf{S}(F_a, F_b, F_c)$ be symmetric. Then its Hilbert series and Frobenius number are given by*

$$\begin{aligned} H(F_a, F_b, F_c) &= \frac{(1 - z^{f_1})(1 - z^{f_2})}{(1 - z^{F_a})(1 - z^{F_b})(1 - z^{F_c})}, \quad f_1 = \frac{F_a F_b}{F_{\gcd(a,b)}}, \quad f_2 = F_c \cdot F_{\gcd(a,b)}, \\ \mathcal{F}(F_a, F_b, F_c) &= f_1 + f_2 - (F_a + F_b + F_c). \end{aligned} \quad (19)$$

The next Corollary 4 gives only the sufficient condition for $\mathbf{S}(F_a, F_b, F_c)$ to be symmetric and is less strong than Theorem 5. However, instead of containment (16) it sets an inequality which is easy to check out.

Corollary 4 *Let F_c , F_b and F_a be the Fibonacci numbers where $c > b > a \geq 5$. Then a numerical semigroup $\mathbf{S}(F_a, F_b, F_c)$ is symmetric if*

$$\lambda = \gcd(a, b) \geq 3, \quad \gcd(\lambda, c) = 1, 2, \quad F_c F_\lambda > \text{lcm}(F_a, F_b) - F_a - F_b. \quad (20)$$

The Hilbert series and Frobenius number are given by (19).

Proof The two first relations in (20) are taken from Theorem 5 and were proven in (18). We have to use also the containment (16). For this purpose take F_c exceeding the Frobenius number of semigroup generated by two numbers F_a/F_λ and F_b/F_λ . This number $\mathcal{F}(F_a/F_\lambda, F_b/F_\lambda)$ is classically known due to Sylvester [13]. So, we get

$$F_c > \frac{F_a F_b}{F_\lambda F_\lambda} - \frac{F_a}{F_\lambda} - \frac{F_b}{F_\lambda} = \frac{\text{lcm}(F_a, F_b) - F_a - F_b}{F_\lambda},$$

where the Hilbert series $H(F_a, F_b, F_c)$ and Frobenius number $\mathcal{F}(F_a, F_b, F_c)$ are given by (19).

Thus, Corollary is proven. $\square$

We finish this Section by Example 1 where the Fibonacci triple does satisfy the containment in (16) but does not satisfy inequality in (20).

Example 1 $\{d_1, d_2, d_3\} = \{F_6 = 8, F_8 = 21, F_9 = 34\}$

$$\begin{aligned} \gcd(F_6, F_9) &= F_3, \quad \gcd(F_3, F_8) = 1, \quad F_8 \in \mathbf{S}\left(\frac{F_6}{F_3}, \frac{F_9}{F_3}\right) = \mathbf{S}(4, 17), \\ f_1 &= \text{lcm}(F_6, F_9) = 136, \quad f_2 = F_8 \cdot F_3 = 42, \quad F_8 \cdot F_3 < \text{lcm}(F_6, F_9) - F_6 - F_9, \\ H(F_6, F_8, F_9) &= \frac{(1 - z^{136})(1 - z^{42})}{(1 - z^8)(1 - z^{21})(1 - z^{34})}, \quad \mathcal{F}(F_6, F_8, F_9) = 115, \quad G(F_6, F_8, F_9) = 58. \end{aligned}$$

5 Symmetric numerical semigroups generated by Lucas triple

In this Section we consider symmetric numerical semigroups generated by three Lucas numbers L_n , L_m and L_k , $n > m > k \geq 2$. Note that the case $k = 2$ is trivial because of Lucas number $L_2 = 3$ and Theorem 2. The semigroup $\mathbf{S}(L_2, L_m, L_n)$ is symmetric iff at least one of two requirements, $3 \nmid L_m$ and $L_n \notin \mathbf{S}(3, L_m)$, is broken.

Theorem 6 Let L_k, L_m and L_n , $n, m, k \geq 3$, be the Lucas numbers and let

$$m = 2^a m', \quad n = 2^b n', \quad k = 2^c k', \quad \text{where } m' = n' = k' \equiv 1 \pmod{2}, \quad a, b, c \geq 0, \quad (21)$$

$$l = \gcd(m, n) = 2^d l', \quad \text{where } l' = \gcd(m', n') \equiv 1 \pmod{2}, \quad d = \min\{a, b\}.$$

Then a numerical semigroup generated by these numbers is symmetric iff L_k, L_m and L_n satisfy

$$L_k \in S\left(\frac{L_m}{L_l}, \frac{L_n}{L_l}\right), \quad \text{if } a = b, \quad \text{or } L_k \in S\left(\frac{L_m}{2}, \frac{L_n}{2}\right), \quad \text{if } a \neq b, \quad (22)$$

and one of three following relations:

$$\begin{aligned} 1) \quad & a = b \neq 0, & a = b \neq c, \quad 3 \nmid \gcd(k, l), \\ 2) \quad & a = b = 0, \quad \gcd(m', n') > 1, & \begin{cases} c = 0, \quad \gcd(k', l') = 1, \\ c \neq 0, \quad 3 \nmid \gcd(k, l), \end{cases} \\ 3) \quad & a \neq b, \quad 3 \mid \gcd(m, n), & 3 \nmid k. \end{aligned} \quad (23)$$

Proof By Theorem 1 and Corollary 1 a numerical semigroup $S(L_k, L_m, L_n)$ is symmetric iff there exist two relatively not prime elements of its minimal generating set such that

$$\eta = \gcd(L_n, L_m) > 1, \quad \gcd(L_k, \eta) = 1, \quad L_k \in S\left(\frac{L_n}{\eta}, \frac{L_m}{\eta}\right). \quad (24)$$

Represent n and m as in (21) and substitute them into the 1st relation in (24). By consequence of Theorem 4 it holds iff

$$1) \quad a = b, \quad \gcd(m, n) > 1 \quad \text{or} \quad 2) \quad a \neq b, \quad 3 \mid \gcd(m, n). \quad (25)$$

First, assume that the 1st requirement in (25) holds that results by Theorem 4 in $\eta = L_l$. Making use of notations (21) for k move on to the 2nd requirement in (24) and apply Corollary (2). Here we have to consider two cases $a = b \neq 0$ and $a = b = 0$ separately.

$$a = b \neq 0, \quad a = b \neq c, \quad 3 \nmid \gcd(k, l) = 1, \quad (26)$$

$$a = b = 0, \quad \gcd(m', n') > 1, \quad \begin{cases} c = 0, \quad \gcd(k', l') = 1, \\ c \neq 0, \quad 3 \nmid \gcd(k, l). \end{cases} \quad (27)$$

Now, assume that the 2nd requirement in (25) holds that results by Theorem 4 in $\eta = 2$. Making use of the 2nd requirement in (24) and applying (14) we get,

$$a \neq b, \quad 3 \mid \gcd(m, n), \quad 3 \nmid k. \quad (28)$$

Combining (26), (27) and (28) we arrive at (23). The last requirement in (24) together with Theorem 4 gives

$$L_k = A \frac{L_m}{\eta} + B \frac{L_n}{\eta} = \begin{cases} A \cdot L_m / L_l + B \cdot L_n / L_l & \text{if } a = b \\ A \cdot L_m / 2 + B \cdot L_n / 2 & \text{if } a \neq b \end{cases}, \quad A, B \in \mathbb{Z}_+,$$

that proves (22) and finishes proof of Theorem. $\square$

By consequence of Theorem 6 the following Corollary holds for the most simple Lucas triples.

Corollary 5 *Let $L_{k'}$, $L_{m'}$ and $L_{n'}$ be the Lucas numbers with odd indices such that*

$$\gcd(m', n') > 1, \quad \gcd(m', n', k') = 1. \quad (29)$$

Then a numerical semigroup generated by these numbers is symmetric iff

$$L_{k'} \in S \left(\frac{L_{m'}}{L_{\gcd(m', n')}}, \frac{L_{n'}}{L_{\gcd(m', n')}} \right). \quad (30)$$

Proof follows if we apply Theorem 6 in the case $a = b = c = 0$, see (27).

We give without derivation the Hilbert series and Frobenius number for symmetric semigroup $S(L_{k'}, L_{m'}, L_{n'})$.

$$\begin{aligned} H(L_{n'}, L_{m'}, L_{k'}) &= \frac{(1 - z^{l_1})(1 - z^{l_2})}{(1 - z^{L_{n'}})(1 - z^{L_{m'}})(1 - z^{L_{k'}})}, \quad l_1 = \frac{L_{n'} \cdot L_{m'}}{L_{\gcd(m', n')}} , \\ \mathcal{F}(L_{n'}, L_{m'}, L_{k'}) &= l_1 + l_2 - (L_{n'} + L_{m'} + L_{k'}), \quad l_2 = L_{k'} \cdot L_{\gcd(m', n')}. \end{aligned} \quad (31)$$

In general, the containment (30) is hardly to verify because it presumes algorithmic procedure. Instead, one can formulate a simple inequality which provide only the sufficient condition for semigroup $S(L_{n'}, L_{m'}, L_{k'})$ to be symmetric.

Corollary 6 *Let $L_{n'}$, $L_{m'}$ and $L_{k'}$ be the Lucas numbers with odd indices such that (29) is satisfied and the following inequality holds,*

$$L_{k'} L_{\gcd(m', n')} > \frac{L_{n'} L_{m'}}{L_{\gcd(m', n')}} - L_{n'} - L_{m'}. \quad (32)$$

Then a numerical semigroup $S(L_{n'}, L_{m'}, L_{k'})$ is symmetric and its Hilbert series and Frobenius number are given by (31).

Its proof is completely similar to the proof of Corollary 4 for symmetric semigroup generated by three Fibonacci numbers.

We finish this Section by Example 2 where the Lucas triple does satisfy the containment in (30) but does not satisfy inequality (32).

Example 2 $\{d_1, d_2, d_3\} = \{L_9 = 76, L_{15} = 1364, L_{17} = 3571\}$

$$\begin{aligned} \gcd(L_9, L_{15}) &= L_3, \quad \gcd(L_3, L_{17}) = 1, \quad L_{17} \in S \left(\frac{L_9}{L_3}, \frac{L_{15}}{L_3} \right) = S(19, 341), \\ l_1 &= \text{lcm}(L_9, L_{15}) = 25916, \quad l_2 = L_{17} \cdot L_3 = 14264, \quad L_{17} \cdot L_3 < \text{lcm}(L_9, L_{15}) - L_9 - L_{15}, \\ H(L_9, L_{15}, L_{17}) &= \frac{(1 - z^{25916})(1 - z^{14264})}{(1 - z^{76})(1 - z^{1364})(1 - z^{3571})}, \\ \mathcal{F}(L_9, L_{15}, L_{17}) &= 35189, \quad G(L_9, L_{15}, L_{17}) = 17595. \end{aligned}$$

Acknowledgement

I thank C. Cooper for bringing the paper [9] to my attention.

References

- [1] R. Apéry, *Sur les Branches superlinéaires des Courbes Algébriques*,
C. R. Acad. Sci. Paris, **222**, 1198 (1946). MR **8**, 221
- [2] R. D. Carmichael, *On the Numerical Factors of the Arithmetic Forms $\alpha^n \pm \beta^n$* ,
Annals of Math., **15**, 30-70 (1913)
- [3] L. G. Fel, *Frobenius Problem for Semigroups $S(d_1, d_2, d_3)$* ,
Funct. Analysis and Other Math., **1**, # 2, 119-157 (2006)
- [4] J. Herzog, *Generators and Relations of Abelian Semigroups and Semigroup Rings*,
Manuscripta Math., **3**, 175 (1970)
- [5] J. Herzog and E. Kunz, *Die Werthhalbgruppe Eines Lokalen Rings der Dimension 1*,
Sitzungsberichte der Heidelberger Akademie der Wissenschaften, Springer, Berlin (1971)
- [6] S. M. Johnson, *A Linear Diophantine Problem*,
Canad. J. Math., **12**, 390 (1960)
- [7] E. Lucas, *Theorie des Fonctions Numeriques Simplement Periodiques*,
Amer. J. Math., **1**, 184-240, 289-321 (1878)
- [8] J. M. Marin, J. Ramirez Alfonsin and M. P. Revuelta, *On the Frobenius Number of Fibonacci Numerical Semigroups*,
Integers: Electron. J. Comb. Number Theory, **7**, # A14 (2007)
- [9] W. L. McDaniel, *The G.C.D in Lucas Sequences and Lehmer Number Sequences*,
Fibonacci Quarterly, **29**, 24-29 (1991)
- [10] A. Restivo, *Permutation property and the Fibonacci semigroup*,
Semigroup Forum, **38**, 337-345 (1989)
- [11] R. P. Stanley, *Combinatorics and Commutative Algebra*,
Birkhäuser Boston, 2nd ed, (1996)
- [12] P. Ribenboim, *Square Classes of Fibonacci and Lucas Numbers*,
Port. Math., **46**, 159-175 (1989)

- [13] J. J. Sylvester, *Problems from the Theory of Numbers, with Solutions*, Educational Times, **4**, 171 (1884)
- [14] K. Watanabe, *Some Examples of 1-dim Gorenstein Domains*, Nagoya Math. J., **49**, 101 (1973)